
From: [Vivian Krause](#)

Subject: **Farmed Salmon and Salmon Aquaculture**

Date: September 10, 2007 12:26:35 PM PDT

To: [Jim Hoggan](#)

Cc: [ecarley@mec.ca](#), [Elois Yaxley](#), [Pat Bell](#), [Robin Austin](#), [Ron Cantelon](#), [10 more](#)

Mr. Hoggan,

I am writing to you in your role as Chair of the Board of the David Suzuki Foundation.

I am writing to re-iterate my concerns about the position of the David Suzuki Foundation regarding farmed salmon and salmon farming, as outlined originally in my letter to Dr. Suzuki, of 11 May 2007, and to re-iterate my request to meet with you to discuss and begin to resolve this matter.

I can be reached at 604.219.5905.

Sincerely,
Vivian Krause

On Friday, June 22, 2007, at 04:22PM, "Kirsten Brynelsen" <kbrynelsen@hoggan.com> wrote:

>Hi Vivian;

>

>A copy of your email has been forward to Jay Ritchlin, Marine Campaign

>Specialist who deals with these matters. Please direct all future

>inquires to him. Email: jritchlin@davidsuzuki.com.

>

>Thank you,

>Cheryl Tauber

>

>-----Original Message-----

>From: Vivian Krause [mailto:vivian.krause@mac.com]

>Sent: Monday, June 18, 2007 4:21 PM

>To: Kirsten Brynelsen

>Cc: elois@newdata.ca; jritchlin@davidsuzuki.org

>Subject: Message for Mr. James Hoggan regarding a letter to Dr. David

>Suzuki

>

>Cheryl,

>

>As discussed, I would appreciate it if you would please forward this

>letter to Mr. Hoggan.

>

>As outlined below, I am seeking answers to the questions that I

>presented to Dr. David Suzuki in my letter of 11 May 2007 (attached).

>

>I can be reached at 604.219.5905 or by e-mail at vivian.krause@mac.com

>

>Sincerely,

>Vivian Krause

>

>

>On Friday, June 15, 2007, at 12:09PM, "Vivian Krause"

>>vivian.krause@mac.com> wrote:

>>Mr. Ritchlin,

>>

>>Thank you for your response.

>>

>>I am copying this correspondence to Ms. Brynelsen, Executive Assisstant

>>to Mr. James Hoggan and would ask her to please forward this e-mail to

>>Mr. Hoggan in his capacity as Chair of the David Suzuki Foundation.

>>

>>As per my e-mail of 15 May 2007, I am also copying this e-mail to the

>Members of the Legislature of the Special Committee on Sustainable
>Aquaculture, to Mary Ellen Walling of the B.C. Salmon Farmers
>Association, and to Mayor Gerry Furney, of Port McNeill.

>>

>>For Mr. Hoggan's reference, I have attached my letter of 11 May 2007,
>to Dr. David Suzuki.

>>

>>In the information posted at www.seachoice.org, and in the printed
>version of "Canada's Seafood Guide", The David Suzuki Foundation and
>other environmental organizations that are members of Sustainable
>Seafood Canada, assert that "regular consumption of farmed salmon" poses
>a "health threat" from PCBs, dioxins or pesticides.

>>

>>As I outlined in my letter of 11 May 2007, based on my extensive review
>of the scientific literature, I do not see a sound scientific basis on
>which to conclude that farmed salmon is high in contaminants or that
>farmed salmon poses a "health threat."

>>

>>You stated below that The David Suzuki Foundation "stands by the work
>that we have published." I would like to ask you to clarify what you
>are referring to. Are you saying that the the David Suzuki Foundation
>"stands by" the position that farmed salmon is high in contaminants and
>poses a "health threat?"

>>

>>As I stated in my letter of 11 May 2007, I have also noticed that the
>Farmed & Dangerous campaign is mentioned by the PCFFA in relation to the
>"antifarmed salmon effort." The sea lice research, funded and
>publicized by the David Suzuki Foundation, was publicized by SeaWeb
>during the time when SeaWeb was funded by the Gordon and Betty Moore
>Foundation to "integrate aquaculture science messages into the
>antifarming campaign" and to "shift consumer and retailer demand away
>from farmed salmon." I find it difficult to reconcile the apparent
>involvement of the David Suzuki Foundation in an "antifarmed salmon
>effort" and an "antifarming campaign", with your statement, below, that
>you are working to see "ecologically responsible aquaculture become a
>reality" Does the David Suzuki Foundation consider that Alaska's
>extensive salmon ranching program is "ecologically responsible
>aquaculture?"

>>

>>For the reasons outlined in my letter, I can not see how demarketing
>farmed salmon helps to protect human health or the biodiversity of wild
>salmon. I can see how demarketing farmed salmon improves the market for
>Alaskan wild salmon.

>>

>>In your reply (below), you have not answered the questions that I asked
>in my letter of 11 May 2007 about whether research funded and publicized
>by the David Suzuki Foundation conforms to the principles and policies
>for scientific conduct of Canada's Tri-Council on Integrity in Research
>and Scholarship, and the U.S. Office of Research Integrity. I would
>appreciate your response to this question.

>>

>>As I asked in my letter of 11 May 2007, I would also like to know:

>>

>>1. Is the David Suzuki Foundation one of the environmental
>organizations that was or is working with the Alaska Seafood Marketing
>Institute?

>>

>>2. Is the David Suzuki Foundation one of the "antifarming ENGOs" that
>the Gordon and Betty Moore Foundation funded SeaWeb to coordinate in an
>"antifarming campaign" for which the purpose, as stated in documents
>submitted to the U.S. Internatal Revenue Service, was "to shift consumer
>and retailer demand away from farmed salmon?"

>>

>>I will appreciate your answer to these questions.

>>

>>Sincerely,
>>Vivian Krause

>>
>>

>>On Thursday, June 14, 2007, at 04:02PM, "Jay Ritchlin"

><jritchlin@davidsuzuki.org> wrote:

>>>Dear Ms. Krause,

>>>
>>>I was forwarded your messages and letter and I have briefly reviewed
>>>them. I also received your voice mail today. Thank you for your
>interest
>>>in our work.

>>>
>>>The David Suzuki Foundation stands by the work that we have published
>>>and by our continued efforts to see ecologically responsible
>aquaculture

>>>become a reality in BC and Canada. We base our work on analyses of
>both

>>>the published literature and available policy options, and we apply
>the

>>>precautionary principle to areas where evidence is compelling, or
>raises

>>>serious concerns, but incomplete.

>>>
>>>We appreciate your questions and comments, however we do not have the
>>>ability to respond in detail to every person who requests us to do so.

>I

>>>encourage you to follow developments in our aquaculture and
>sustainable

>>>fisheries campaigns through our web site www.davidsuzuki.org/Oceans.

>>>

>>>Sincerely,

>>>

>>>Jay Ritchlin

>>>Marine Campaign Strategist

>>>

>>>David Suzuki Foundation

>>>219-2211 W. 4th Ave.

>>>Vancouver, BC

>>>Canada V6K 4S2

>>>

>>>ph: 604-732-4228

>>>fx: 604-732-0752

>>>em: jritchlin@davidsuzuki.org

>>>

>>>www.davidsuzuki.org

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>-----Original Message-----

>>>From: Elois Yaxley

>>>Sent: Thursday, June 14, 2007 10:47 AM

>>>To: Jay Ritchlin

>>>Subject: FW: Letter to Dr. David Suzuki

>>>

>>>

>>>

>>>-----Original Message-----

>>>From: Elois Yaxley

>>>Sent: Thursday, June 14, 2007 10:46 AM

>>>To: 'Vivian Krause'

>>>Subject: RE: Letter to Dr. David Suzuki

>>>

>>>Greetings Vivian,

>>>Thank you for your email. David Suzuki stated in a previous email that

>>>he is unable to speak with you, or communicate with you at this time
>and
>>>he requested that you deal with the Marine folks at the David Suzuki
>>>Foundation.

>>>Elois

>>>

>>>-----Original Message-----

>>>From: Vivian Krause [mailto:vivian.krause@mac.com]

>>>Sent: Thursday, June 14, 2007 9:54 AM

>>>To: Elois Yaxley

>>>Cc: Robin Austin; ron.cantelon.mla@leg.bc.ca;

>gary.coons.mla@leg.bc.ca;

>>>Scott Fraser; al.horning.mla@leg.bc.ca; Daniel Jarvis;

>>>gregor.robertson.mla@leg.bc.ca; John Yap; Clare Travena;

>>>al.minister@gov.bc.ca; mayor.portmcneill@telus.net; mwalling@telus.net

>>>Subject: Letter to Dr. David Suzuki

>>>

>>>Ms. Yaxley,

>>>

>>>It has now been one month since I sent my letter of 11 May 2007 to Dr.

>>>Suzuki.

>>>

>>>I called your office this morning to speak with you. Your

>receptionist

>>>told me that you were not able to speak with me nor to return my call

>>>but that you suggested that I speak with someone in the Marine

>program.

>>>My call was put through by your receptionist, to Jay Ritchlin and I

>have

>>>left a voice mail message for him.

>>>

>>>I would appreciate it if Dr. Suzuki or whomever he delegates would

>>>please return my call today or tomorrow morning.

>>>I can be reached at 604.219.5905.

>>>

>>>I would also appreciate your acknowledgement of the receipt of this

>>>e-mail and that it has been relayed to Dr. Suzuki.

>>>

>>>Sincerely,

>>>Vivian Krause

>>>

>>>On Tuesday, June 05, 2007, at 04:56PM, "Vivian Krause"

>>><vivian.krause@mac.com> wrote:

>>>>Dr. Suzuki,

>>>>

>>>>I am writing to let you know that I am concerned that I have not yet

>>>>heard from your staff.

>>>>

>>>>I can be reached at 604.219.5905 or at vivian.krause@mac.com.

>>>>

>>>>Sincerely,

>>>>Vivian Krause

>>>>

>>>>On Wednesday, May 23, 2007, at 11:27 AM, "Vivian Krause"

>>>><vivian.krause@mac.com> wrote:

>>>>

>>>>>Dr. Suzuki,

>>>>>

>>>>>I am writing to let you know that I have not yet heard from your

>>>>>staff.

>>>>>

>>>>>Perhaps you could let me know who I will be hearing from, and when?

>>>>>

>>>>>I can be reached at 604.219.5905 or at vivian.krause@mac.com

>>>>>

>>>>>Sincerely,
>>>>>Vivian Krause
>>>>>

>>>>>On Tuesday, May 15, 2007, at 11:05AM, "Vivian Krause"
>>>>><vivian.krause@mac.com> wrote:

>>>>>Dear Dr. Suzuki,
>>>>>

>>>>>Thank you for responding to my letter.
>>>>>

>>>>>I will expect to hear from your Foundation's staff, as you have
>>>directed.

>>>>>
>>>>>As the matters and questions here are of importance to British
>>>>>Columbia - particularly our coastal communities, and to the salmon
>>>>>farming industry, I am sharing a copy of my letter to you, with
>>>>>Minister Pat Bell, with Mayor Gerry Furney, and with the B.C.

>Salmon
>>>Farmers Association. I would appreciate it if you or your staff
>would
>>>also share your response to my letter with these parties.

>>>>>
>>>>>I can be reached anytime at 604.219.5905.

>>>>>
>>>>>Once again, thank you for taking time to respond to my letter.
>>>>>

>>>>>Sincerely,
>>>>>Vivian Krause
>>>>>

>>>>>On Tuesday, May 15, 2007, at 10:17AM, "Elois Yaxley"
>>>>><elois@newdata.ca> wrote:

>>>>>Dear Ms. Krause,
>>>>>>I'm filming in the Okanagan with the Nature of Things and I am not
>

>>>>>>able to call you. I have asked Elois to forward your email along
>to

>>>
>>>>>>the Foundation's staff in the Marine program and I've asked them
>to
>>>>>>respond to you. David Suzuki
>>>>>>

>>>>>>-----Original Message-----
>>>>>>From: Vivian Krause [mailto:vivian.krause@mac.com]
>>>>>>Sent: Tuesday, May 15, 2007 9:06 AM
>>>>>>To: Elois Yaxley
>>>>>>Cc: robin.austin.mla@leg.bc.ca; ron.cantelon.mla@leg.bc.ca;
>>>>>>gary.coons.mla@leg.bc.ca; Scott Fraser; al.horning.mla@leg.bc.ca;
>>>>>>Daniel Jarvis; Gregor Robertson; shane.simpson.mla@leg.bc.ca; John
>

>>>>>>>Yap; clare.travena.mla@leg.bc.ca
>>>>>>>Subject: RE: Salmon Aquaculture
>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>Ms. Yaxley,
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>Thank you for your reply and for attending to this matter.
>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>As before, I can be reached at 604.219.5905.
>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>Sincerely,
>>>>>>>Vivian Krause
>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>On Tuesday, May 15, 2007, at 08:25AM, "Elois Yaxley"
>>>>>>><elois@newdata.ca>

>>>>>>>wrote:
>>>>>>>>Dear Ms. Krause,
>>>>>>>>>I've taken the liberty of forwarding your email along to the

>>>>>>>Director of the Marine Program and the Marine Campaign strategist

>

>>>>>>>and I've asked

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>them to respond to your questions as I have not heard from David
>>>>>>>yet.

>>>>>>>Perhaps they will be able to provide you with the answers you are

>

>>>>>>>seeking. Elois

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>-----Original Message-----

>>>>>>>From: Vivian Krause [mailto:vivian.krause@mac.com]

>>>>>>>Sent: Tuesday, May 15, 2007 7:58 AM

>>>>>>>To: Elois Yaxley

>>>>>>>Cc: robin.austin.mla@leg.bc.ca; ron.cantelon.mla@leg.bc.ca;

>>>>>>>gary.coons.mla@leg.bc.ca; Scott Fraser; al.horning.mla@leg.bc.ca;

>

>>>>>>>Daniel Jarvis; Gregor Robertson; shane.simpson.mla@leg.bc.ca;

>John

>>>>>>>Yap;

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>clare.travena.mla@leg.bc.ca

>>>>>>>Subject: Salmon Aquaculture

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>Ms. Yaxley,

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>Thank you for your reply. I understand that Dr. Suzuki has many
>>>>>>>demands on his time.

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>My letter outlines three main questions that I would like to ask

>>>>>>>Dr.

>>>>>>>Suzuki.

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>The first question is about whether the studies on contaminants

>in

>>>>>>>farmed salmon and sea lice, funded and/or publicized by the David

>

>>>>>>>Suzuki foundation, conform to relevant principles and policies of

>

>>>>>>>scientific conduct and integrity. I appreciate that answering

>this

>>>

>>>>>>>question will take some analysis and discussion, and is not a

>brief

>>>>>>>matter.

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>My second question is whether the David Suzuki Foundation is one

>of

>>>

>>>>>>>the

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>environmental organizations that is or has been working with the

>>>>>>>Alaska

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>Seafood Marketing Institute.

>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>My third question is whether the David Suzuki Foundation is one

>of

>>>>>>>the "antifarming ENGOS" in the "antifarming campaign" "to shift

>

>>>>>>>consumer and retail demand away from farmed salmon." Having

>>>>>>>noticed that the sea lice research funded and publicized by the

>>>>>>>David Suzuki Foundation was also publicized by SeaWeb, I would

>>>>>>>like to know whether the sea lice research findings are one of

>the

>>>"aquaculture 'science' messages"
>>>>>>>that was "integrated into the antifarming campaign," that SeaWeb
>>>>>>>conducted for the Moore Foundation.
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>Considering that this matter is of public interest, particularly
>>>>>>>now as
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>the Special Committee on Sustainable Aquaculture is about to
>present
>>>
>>>>>>>its
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>recommendations to the Legislature, I would appreciate it very
>much
>>>
>>>>>>>if Dr. Suzuki would take the time to answer these questions.
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>Dr. Suzuki can reach me anytime at vivian.krause@mac.com or on my
>
>>>>>>>cell phone at 604.219.5905.
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>Sincerely,
>>>>>>>Vivian Krause
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>On Monday, May 14, 2007, at 01:55 PM, "Elois Yaxley"
>>>>>>><elois@newdata.ca>
>>>>>>>wrote:
>>>>>>>Dear Ms. Krause,
>>>>>>>I've forwarded your email along to David and will be in touch
>with
>>>
>>>>>>>his
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>response when I receive it. David is working with The Nature of
>
>>>>>>>Things
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>this week in the Okanagan and I don't know when he'll have time
>to
>>>
>>>>>>>access his emails. I know that he has an extremely busy
>schedule
>>>>>>>with
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>them so I doubt that he will be able to speak with you
>personally
>>>>>>>at this time.
>>>>>>>Elois
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>-----Original Message-----
>>>>>>>From: Vivian Krause [mailto:vivian.krause@mac.com]
>>>>>>>Sent: Monday, May 14, 2007 12:49 PM
>>>>>>>To: Elois Yaxley
>>>>>>>Cc: robin.austin.mla@leg.bc.ca; ron.cantelon.mla@leg.bc.ca;
>>>>>>>gary.coons.mla@leg.bc.ca; Scott Fraser;
>>>>>>>al.horning.mla@leg.bc.ca;
>>>>>>>Daniel Jarvis; Gregor Robertson; shane.simpson.mla@leg.bc.ca;
>John
>>>
>>>>>>>Yap;
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>clare.travena.mla@leg.bc.ca
>>>>>>>Subject: Salmon Aquaculture - the correct attachment
>>>>>>>
>>>>>>>Ms. Yaxley,

